

# St. John's Law Review

---

Volume 46  
Number 2 *Volume 46, December 1971, Number*  
2

Article 6

---

## The Quarterly Survey of New York Practice Table of Contents

St. John's Law Review

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarship.law.stjohns.edu/lawreview>

---

This Recent Development in New York Law is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at St. John's Law Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in St. John's Law Review by an authorized editor of St. John's Law Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact [selbyc@stjohns.edu](mailto:selbyc@stjohns.edu).

# THE QUARTERLY SURVEY OF NEW YORK PRACTICE

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ARTICLE 2 — LIMITATIONS OF TIME</b>	
<i>CPLR 208: Tolling provision held applicable even though prisoner had legal capacity to sue</i> .....	357
<b>ARTICLE 3 — JURISDICTION AND SERVICE, APPEARANCE AND CHOICE OF COURT</b>	
<i>CPLR 302: Dual jurisdictional aspects of matrimonial action upheld</i> .....	358
<i>CPLR 302(a)(1): Further construction of the phrase "transaction of business" ...</i>	360
<i>CPLR 302(a)(1): Third party's video tape distribution in New York of monologue not a "transaction of business" by performer</i> .....	361
<i>CPLR 302(a)(2): Careful distinction between contract and tort actions espoused ..</i>	362
<i>CPLR 308(2): Construction of "dwelling place"</i> .....	363
<b>ARTICLE 10 — PARTIES GENERALLY</b>	
<i>CPLR 1005(a): New York court refuses to extend basis for class actions</i> .....	365
<i>CPLR 1007: Indemnification clause interpreted to cover active negligence</i> .....	367
<b>ARTICLE 11 — POOR PERSONS</b>	
<i>CPLR 1102: Poor person held entitled to assignment of counsel in action for nonpayment of rent</i> .....	368
<b>ARTICLE 15 — ACTIONS AGAINST PERSONS JOINTLY LIABLE</b>	
<i>CPLR 1502: A proceeding pursuant to article 75 can be a subsequent action</i> ....	369
<b>ARTICLE 20 — MISTAKES, DEFECTS, IRREGULARITIES AND EXTENSIONS OF TIME</b>	
<i>CPLR 2001: Failure to state court and county in summons is a jurisdictional defect</i> .....	371
<b>ARTICLE 22 — STAY, MOTIONS, ORDERS AND MANDATES</b>	
<i>CPLR 2201: Court stays actions under comity to avoid multiple suits</i> .....	372
<b>ARTICLE 30 — REMEDIES AND PLEADINGS</b>	
<i>CPLR 3031, 3033, 3034: Motion for settlement of terms is prerequisite to motion for judgment under Simplified Procedure</i> .....	373
<b>ARTICLE 32 — ACCELERATED JUDGMENT</b>	
<i>Collateral Estoppel: Stranger to prior suit properly held not bound by previous determination of the issues</i> .....	374
<b>ARTICLE 41 — TRIAL BY A JURY</b>	
<i>CPLR 4102: Conduct of parties held to constitute a waiver of the right to a jury trial</i> .....	375
<b>ARTICLE 52 — ENFORCEMENT OF MONEY JUDGMENTS</b>	
<i>CPLR 5222: Liability of the judgment creditor is not absolute</i> .....	376
<i>CPLR 5240: Court protects "interested" third party from execution sale</i> .....	378
<b>ARTICLE 71 — RECOVERY OF CHATTEL</b>	
<i>CPLR 7102: Contractual waiver of the right to notice and a hearing deemed ineffective for the ex parte seizure of certain types of property</i> .....	379
<b>ARTICLE 75 — ARBITRATION</b>	
<i>CPLR 7501: Article 75 held applicable to advisory arbitration</i> .....	384
<i>CPLR 7511(b)(1)(ii): Arbitration award vacated where challenged arbitrator appointed by American Arbitration Association previously had attorney-client relationship with one of the parties</i> .....	385
<b>NEW YORK CITY CIVIL COURT ACT</b>	
<i>CCA 103: Operation of the conference and assignment method of disposition of cases</i> .....	387

NEW YORK EDUCATION LAW

N.Y. Educ. Law § 3813: Monetary demand is an essential element of a verified claim ..... 389

CRIMINAL CONTEMPT PROCEEDINGS

Contempt: Judicial and criminal contempt convictions arising out of single episode not barred under double jeopardy prohibition ..... 390

SURROGATE PRACTICE

Waiver of citation and consent to probate: Pre-probate decree withdrawal permitted where status quo remained unchanged ..... 392

Introduction\*

Decisions praiseworthy and blameworthy, by liberal and conservative courts, are reported in this installment of the Survey. One liberal court laudably construed CPLR 208 literally, to preserve a prisoner's cause of action; a second logically interpreted an indemnification clause, according to its fair intendment, to encompass active negligence; and a third held that a poor person is entitled, under the fourteenth amendment, to assignment of counsel in an action for non-payment of rent. Contrastingly, conservative courts espoused careful distinction, under CPLR 302, between contract cases and tort actions, and refused to extend the basis of class actions. Also noteworthy, is a case of first impression, in which it was held that the liability under CPLR 5222 of a judgment creditor is not absolute.

The reader's attention is particularly directed to the extended treatment under CPLR article 71. Discussed thereunder are two recent

\* The following abbreviations will be used uniformly throughout the Survey:

New York Civil Practice Law and Rules .....CPLR
New York Civil Practice Act .....CPA
New York Rules of Civil Practice .....RCP
New York City Civil Court Act .....CCA
Uniform District Court Act .....UDCA
Uniform City Court Act .....UCCA
Real Property Actions and Proceedings Law .....RPAPL
Domestic Relations Law .....DRL

WEINSTEIN, KORN AND MILLER, NEW YORK CIVIL PRACTICE (1969) .....WK&M

The Biannual Survey of New York Practice ..... The Biannual Survey

The Quarterly Survey of New York Practice ..... The Quarterly Survey

Extremely valuable in understanding the CPLR are the five reports of the Advisory Committee on Practice and Procedure. They are contained in the following legislative documents and will be cited as follows.

1957 N.Y. LEG. DOC. No. 6(b) .....FIRST REP.
1958 N.Y. LEG. DOC. No. 13 .....SECOND REP.
1959 N.Y. LEG. DOC. No. 17 .....THIRD REP.
1960 N.Y. LEG. DOC. No. 80 .....FOURTH REP.
1961 FINAL REPORT OF THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

ON PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE .....FINAL REP.

Also valuable are the two joint reports of the Senate Finance and Assembly Ways and Means Committees:

1961 N.Y. LEG. DOC. No. 15 .....FIFTH REP.
1962 N.Y. LEG. DOC. No. 8 .....SIXTH REP.

cases which deem ineffective, contractual waiver of the right to notice and a hearing prior to seizure of certain types of property.

Additionally, the practitioner is urged to familiarize himself with *In re Frutiger*, a Court of Appeals decision which apparently injects fresh thought into an area of law generally understood to be well settled. Therein, the Court upheld the withdrawal, prior to probate decree, of a waiver of citation and consent to probate, despite the absence of any showing of fraud, duress, misrepresentation or other basis for vitiating the waiver, where the status quo remained unchanged, *i.e.*, no interested party's rights were prejudiced.

The *Survey* sets forth in each installment those cases which are deemed to make the most significant contribution to New York's procedural law. Due to limitations of space, however, many other less important, but, nevertheless, significant cases cannot be included. While few cases are exhaustively discussed, it is hoped that the *Survey* accomplishes its basic purpose, *viz.*, to key the practitioner to significant developments in the procedural law of New York.

The Table of Contents is designed to direct the reader to those specific areas of procedural law which may be of importance to him. The various sections of the CPLR which are specifically treated in the cases are listed under their respective titles.

#### ARTICLE 2 — LIMITATIONS OF TIME

*CPLR 208: Tolling provision held applicable even though prisoner had legal capacity to sue.*

Under CPLR 208, the statute of limitations is tolled during a disability due to imprisonment on a criminal charge or conviction for a term less than for life.<sup>1</sup> In *Ortiz v. LaVallee*,<sup>2</sup> a recent Second Circuit decision, the court was confronted with the question of whether the tolling provision was intended to apply even where a prisoner had the legal capacity to bring an action while incarcerated. Plaintiff had instituted this action under the Federal Civil Rights Act of 1871.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The pertinent language of CPLR 208 provides:

If a person entitled to commence an action is, at the time the cause of action accrues . . . imprisoned on a criminal charge or conviction for a term less than for life, and the time otherwise limited for commencing the action is three years or more . . . the time within which the action must be commenced shall be extended to three years after the disability ceases. . . . The time within which the action must be commenced shall not be extended by this provision beyond ten years after the cause of action accrues. . . .

<sup>2</sup> 422 F.2d 912 (2d Cir. 1971).

<sup>3</sup> 42 U.S.C. § 1983 (1964). Plaintiff, in his complaint, alleged that in July of 1965 he was assaulted and mistreated by prison officials while incarcerated in Auburn State Prison.